

BACK COVER PAGE OF  
HOUSE OF COMMONS DEBATES  
OFFICIAL REPORT (HANSARD)  
VOL. 144, NUMBER 084  
18 SEPTEMBER 2009



PAGE DE DOS  
DÉBATS DE LA CHAMBRE DES  
COMMUNES  
COMPTE RENDU OFFICIEL (HANSARD)  
VOL. 144, NUMÉRO 084  
18 SEPTEMBRE 2009

If undelivered, return COVER ONLY to:  
Publishing and Depository Services  
Public Works and Government Services Canada  
Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0S5

En cas de non-livraison,  
retourner cette COUVERTURE SEULEMENT à :  
Les Éditions et Services de dépôt  
Travaux publics et Services gouvernementaux Canada  
Ottawa (Ontario) K1A 0S5

Published under the authority of the Speaker of  
the House of Commons

Publié en conformité de l'autorité  
du Président de la Chambre des communes

#### SPEAKER'S PERMISSION

#### PERMISSION DU PRÉSIDENT

Reproduction of the proceedings of the House of Commons and its Committees, in whole or in part and in any medium, is hereby permitted provided that the reproduction is accurate and is not presented as official. This permission does not extend to reproduction, distribution or use for commercial purpose of financial gain. Reproduction or use outside this permission or without authorization may be treated as copyright infringement in accordance with the *Copyright Act*. Authorization may be obtained on written application to the Office of the Speaker of the House of Commons.

Il est permis de reproduire les délibérations de la Chambre et de ses comités, en tout ou en partie, sur n'importe quel support, pourvu que la reproduction soit exacte et qu'elle ne soit pas présentée comme version officielle. Il n'est toutefois pas permis de reproduire, de distribuer ou d'utiliser les délibérations à des fins commerciales visant la réalisation d'un profit financier. Toute reproduction ou utilisation non permise ou non formellement autorisée peut être considérée comme une violation du droit d'auteur aux termes de la *Loi sur le droit d'auteur*. Une autorisation formelle peut être obtenue sur présentation d'une demande écrite au Bureau du Président de la Chambre.

Reproduction in accordance with this permission does not constitute publication under the authority of the House of Commons. The absolute privilege that applies to the proceedings of the House of Commons does not extend to these permitted reproductions. Where a reproduction includes briefs to a Committee of the House of Commons, authorization for reproduction may be required from the authors in accordance with the *Copyright Act*.

La reproduction conforme à la présente permission ne constitue pas une publication sous l'autorité de la Chambre. Le privilège absolu qui s'applique aux délibérations de la Chambre ne s'étend pas aux reproductions permises. Lorsqu'une reproduction comprend des mémoires présentés à un comité de la Chambre, il peut être nécessaire d'obtenir de leurs auteurs l'autorisation de les reproduire, conformément à la *Loi sur le droit d'auteur*.

Nothing in this permission abrogates or derogates from the privileges, powers, immunities and rights of the House of Commons and its Committees. For greater certainty, this permission does not affect the prohibition against impeaching or questioning the proceedings of the House of Commons in courts or otherwise. The House of Commons retains the right and privilege to find users in contempt of Parliament if a reproduction or use is not in accordance with this permission.

La présente permission ne porte pas atteinte aux privilèges, pouvoirs, immunités et droits de la Chambre et de ses comités. Il est entendu que cette permission ne touche pas l'interdiction de contester ou de mettre en cause les délibérations de la Chambre devant les tribunaux ou autrement. La Chambre conserve le droit et le privilège de déclarer l'utilisateur coupable d'outrage au Parlement lorsque la reproduction ou l'utilisation n'est pas conforme à la présente permission.

Additional copies may be obtained from: Publishing and  
Depository Services  
Public Works and Government Services Canada  
Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0S5  
Telephone: 613-941-5995 or 1-800-635-7943  
Fax: 613-954-5779 or 1-800-565-7757  
publications@tpsgc-pwgsc.gc.ca  
<http://publications.gc.ca>

On peut obtenir des copies supplémentaires en écrivant à : Les  
Éditions et Services de dépôt  
Travaux publics et Services gouvernementaux Canada  
Ottawa (Ontario) K1A 0S5  
Téléphone : 613-941-5995 ou 1-800-635-7943  
Télécopieur : 613-954-5779 ou 1-800-565-7757  
publications@tpsgc-pwgsc.gc.ca  
<http://publications.gc.ca>

Also available on the Parliament of Canada Web Site at the  
following address: <http://www.parl.gc.ca>

Aussi disponible sur le site Web du Parlement du Canada à  
l'adresse suivante : <http://www.parl.gc.ca>

*Supply*

## NAYS

## Members

Anderson	Andre
Atkinson	Attewell
Beatty	Belcher
Bernier	Bird
Blackburn (Jonquière)	Bienkarn
Bourgault	Boyer
Brightwell	Browes
Cadieux	Campbell (Vancouver Centre)
Cardiff	Casey
Chadwick	Champagne (Champlain)
Chartrand	Clark (Brandon—Souris)
Clifford	Cole
Collins	Cook
Cooper	Corbeil
Côté	Couture
Darling	DeBlois
de Cotret	Desjardins
Dick	Dobbie
Domn	Dorin
Edwards	Epp
Fee	Feltham
Ferland	Fontaine
Fretz	Friesen
Gibeau	Gray (Bonaventure—Îles-de-la-Madeleine)
Greene	Guilbault
Gustafson	Hawkes
Hockin	Horner
Hughes	Jacques
Jelinek	Johnson
Joncas	Jourdenais
Kempling	Koury
Landry	Langlois
Larivière	Layton
Lewis	Loiselle
Lopez	Marin
Masse	Mazankowski
McCreath	McDermid
McDougall (St. Paul's)	McLean
Moore	Mulroney
Nicholson	Oberle
O'Kurley	Paproski
Flourde	Porter
Redway	Reid
Reimer	Ricard
Richardson	Roy-Arcelin
Saint-Julien	Schneider
Scott (Victoria—Haliburton)	Scott (Hamilton—Wentworth)
Shields	Sobecki
Soetens	Sparrow
Stevenson	Tardif
Tétreault	Thacker
Thompson	Thorkelson
Tremblay (Québec—Est)	Tremblay (Lotbinière)
Turner (Halton—Peel)	Van De Walle
Vankoughnet	Vien
Vincent	Weiner
White	Wilbee
Wilson (Swift Current—Maple Creek—Assiniboia)	Winegard
Wilson (Etobicoke Centre)	
Worthy—118	

## PAIRED—MEMBERS

nil/aucun

[English]

Mr. Speaker: I declare the motion lost.

## CORRECTIONS AND CONDITIONAL RELEASE ACT

## MEASURE TO ENACT

The House resumed from Thursday, May 7, consideration of Bill C-36, an act respecting corrections and the conditional release and detention of offenders and to establish the office of Correctional Investigator, as reported (with amendments) from the Standing Committee on Justice and Solicitor General; and on Motions Nos. 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 20 and 22.

Mr. Speaker: Pursuant to Standing Orders 76(8) and 45(6), the House will now proceed to the taking of the deferred divisions on the motions at report stage of Bill C-36.

The hon. member on a point of order.

Mr. Angus: Mr. Speaker, I think you will find that the House would be willing to apply the vote just taken under the opposition motion to the four groups of amendments for Bill C-36 and then a reverse at report stage.

Mr. Speaker: Is it agreed?

Some hon. members: Agreed.

Mr. Speaker: It is so ordered.

The House divided on Motion No. 4 which was negatived on the following division:

(Division No. 138) ..

## YEAS

## Members

Ailmand	Anawak
Angus	Assed
Axworthy (Saskatoon—Clark's Crossing)	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Barrett	Bélair
Bellemare	Berger
Bevilacqua	Black
Blackburn (Brant)	Blondin
Boudria	Catterall
Clancy	Comuzzi
Dingwall	Dionne
Ferguson	Fisher
Fis	Fontana
Foster	Fulton
Galfney	Gagliano
Gauthier	Gray (Windsor West)
Harb	Harvard
Hovdebo	Hunter
Jordan	Karpoff
Keyes	Kliger (Stormont—Dundas)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Langan (Mission—Coquitlam)
Langdon (Essex—Windsor)	Laporte
LeBlanc (Cape Breton Highlands—Canso)	Lee
MacAulay	Maheu
Manley	McLaughlin
Miffin	Milliken
Mills	Mitchell

*Supply*

Motion No. 4 negatived.

The House divided on Motion No. 6, which was negatived on the following division:

(Division No. 139)

Murphy	Nault
Nystrom	Ouellet
Parker	Peterson
Phinney	Proud
Prud'homme	Riis
Robinson	Rompkey
Skelly (Comox—Alberni)	Stewart
Taylor	Tobin
Vancief	Venne
Waddell	Wappel
Whittaker	Wood—74

**NAYS**

Members

Anderson	Andre
Atkinson	Attewell
Beatty	Belsher
Bernier	Bird
Blackburn (Jonquière)	Blenkarn
Bourgault	Boyer
Brightwell	Browes
Cadieux	Campbell (Vancouver Centre)
Cardiff	Casey
Chadwick	Champagne (Champlain)
Chartrand	Clark (Brandon—Souris)
Clifford	Cole
Collins	Cook
Cooper	Corbeil
Côté	Couture
Darling	DeBlois
de Cotret	Desjardins
Dick	Dobbie
Domm	Dorin
Edwards	Epp
Fee	Feltham
Ferland	Fontaine
Fretz	Friesen
Gibeau	Gray (Bonaventure—Îles-de-la-Madeleine)
Greene	Guilbault
Gustafson	Hawkes
Hockin	Horner
Hughes	Jacques
Jelinek	Johnson
Joncas	Jourdenais
Kempling	Koury
Landry	Langlois
Larivière	Layton
Lewis	Loiselle
Lopez	Marin
Masse	Mazankowski
McCreath	McDermid
McDougall (St. Paul's)	McLean
Moore	Mulroney
Nicholson	Oberle
O'Kurley	Paproski
Plourde	Porter
Redway	Reid
Reimer	Ricard
Richardson	Roy-Arcelin
Saint-Julien	Schneider
Scott (Victoria—Haliburton)	Scott (Hamilton—Wentworth)
Shields	Sobeski
Soetens	Sparrow
Stevenson	Tardif
Tétreault	Thacker
Thompson	Thorkelson
Tremblay (Québec—Est)	Tremblay (Lotbinière)
Turner (Halton—Peel)	Van De Walle
Vankoughnet	Vien
Vincent	Weiner
White	Wilbee
Wilson (Swift Current—Maple Creek—Assinibois)	Winegard
Wilson (Etobicoke Centre)	
Worthy—118	

**YEAS**

Members

Allmand	Anawak
Angus	Assad
Arworthy (Saskatoon—Clark's Crossing)	Arworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Barratt	Bélair
Belemare	Berger
Bevilacqua	Black
Blackburn (Brant)	Blondin
Boudria	Catterall
Clancy	Comuzzi
Dingwall	Dionne
Ferguson	Fisher
Fis	Fontana
Roster	Fulton
Gaffney	Gagliano
Gauthier	Gray (Windsor West)
Harb	Harvard
Howlebo	Hunter
Jordan	Karpoff
Keyes	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas)
Kligour (Edmonton Southeast)	Langan (Mission—Coquitlam)
Langdon (Essex—Windsor)	Laporte
LeBlanc (Cape Breton Highlands—Canso)	Lee
MacAulay	Maheu
Manley	McLaughlin
Mifflin	Milliken
Mills	Mitchell
Murphy	Nault
Nystrom	Ouellet
Parker	Peterson
Phinney	Proud
Prud'homme	Riis
Robinson	Rompkey
Skelly (Comox—Alberni)	Stewart
Taylor	Tobin
Vancief	Venne
Waddell	Wappel
Whittaker	Wood—74

**NAYS**

Members

Anderson	Andre
Atkinson	Attewell
Beatty	Belsher
Bernier	Bird
Blackburn (Jonquière)	Blenkarn
Bourgault	Boyer
Brightwell	Browes
Cadieux	Campbell (Vancouver Centre)
Cardiff	Casey
Chadwick	Champagne (Champlain)
Chartrand	Clark (Brandon—Souris)
Clifford	Cole
Collins	Cook
Cooper	Corbeil
Côté	Couture
Darling	DeBlois
de Cotret	Desjardins
Dick	Dobbie

**PAIRED—MEMBERS**

*Supply*

Domm	Dorin
Edwards	Epp
Fee	Feltham
Ferland	Fontaine
Fretz	Friesen
Gibeau	Gray (Bonaventure—Îles-de-la-Madeleine)
Greene	Guilbault
Gustafson	Hawkes
Hockin	Hornet
Hughes	Jacques
Jelinek	Johnson
Joncas	Jourdenais
Kemping	Koury
Landry	Langlois
Larrivée	Layton
Lewis	Loiselle
Lopez	Marin
Masse	Mazankowski
McCreath	McDermid
McDougall (St. Paul's)	McLean
Moore	Mulroney
Nicholson	Oberle
O'Kurley	Paproski
Plourde	Porter
Redway	Reid
Reimer	Ricard
Richardson	Roy-Arcelin
Saint-Julien	Schneider
Scott (Victoria—Haliburton)	Scott (Hamilton—Wentworth)
Shields	Sobeski
Soetens	Sparrow
Stevenson	Tardif
Tétreault	Thacker
Thompson	Thorkelson
Tremblay (Québec—Est)	Tremblay (Lotbinière)
Turner (Halton—Peel)	Van De Walle
Vankoughnet	Vien
Vincent	Weiner
White	Wilbee
Wilson (Swift Current—Maple Creek—Assiniboia)	
Wilson (Etobicoke Centre)	Winegard
Worthy—118	

## PAIRED—MEMBERS

nil/aucun

Motion No. 6 negatived.

The House divided on Motion No. 20, which was negatived on the following division:

*(Division No. 140)*

## YEAS

## Members

Allmand	Answak
Angus	Assad
Axworthy (Saskatoon—Clark's Crossing)	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Barrett	Bélair
Bellemare	Berger
Bevilacqua	Black
Blackburn (Brant)	Blondin
Boudria	Catterall
Ciancy	Comuzzi
Dingwall	Dionne
Ferguson	Fisher
Fis	Fontana
Foster	Fulton
Gaffney	Gagliano
Gauthier	Gray (Windsor West)
Harb	Harvard
Hovdebo	Hunter
Jordan	Karpoff
Keyes	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Langan (Mission—Coquitlam)
Langdon (Essex—Windsor)	Laporte

LeBlanc (Cape Breton Highlands—Canso)	Lee
MacAulay	Maheu
Manley	McLaughlin
Miffin	Milliken
Mills	Mitchell
Murphy	Nault
Nystrom	Ouellet
Parker	Peterson
Phinney	Proud
Prud'homme	Ria
Robinson	Rompkey
Skelly (Comox—Alberni)	Stewart
Taylor	Tobin
Vandriel	Venne
Waddell	Wappel
Whittaker	Wood—74

## NAYS

## Members

Anderson	Andre
Atkinson	Attewell
Baity	Belsher
Bernier	Bird
Blackburn (Jonquière)	Blenkarn
Bourgault	Boyer
Brightwell	Browes
Cadieux	Campbell (Vancouver Centre)
Cardiff	Casey
Chadwick	Champagne (Champlain)
Chartrand	Clark (Brandon—Souris)
Clifford	Cole
Collins	Cook
Cooper	Corbeil
Côté	Couture
Darling	DeBlais
de Cotret	Desjardins
Dick	Dobbie
Domm	Dorin
Edwards	Epp
Fee	Feltham
Ferland	Fontaine
Fretz	Friesen
Gibeau	Gray (Bonaventure—Îles-de-la-Madeleine)
Greene	Guilbault
Gustafson	Hawkes
Hockin	Hornet
Hughes	Jacques
Jelinek	Johnson
Joncas	Jourdenais
Kemping	Koury
Landry	Langlois
Larrivée	Layton
Lewis	Loiselle
Lopez	Marin
Masse	Mazankowski
McCreath	McDermid
McDougall (St. Paul's)	McLean
Moore	Mulroney
Nicholson	Oberle
O'Kurley	Paproski
Plourde	Porter
Redway	Reid
Reimer	Ricard
Richardson	Roy-Arcelin
Saint-Julien	Schneider
Scott (Victoria—Haliburton)	Scott (Hamilton—Wentworth)
Shields	Sobeski
Soetens	Sparrow
Stevenson	Tardif
Tétreault	Thacker
Thompson	Thorkelson
Tremblay (Québec—Est)	Tremblay (Lotbinière)
Turner (Halton—Peel)	Van De Walle
Vankoughnet	Vien
Vincent	Weiner
White	Wilbee
Wilson (Swift Current—Maple Creek—Assiniboia)	
Wilson (Etobicoke Centre)	

Winegard

Worthy—118

**PAIRED—MEMBERS**

nil/aucun

Motion No. 20 negatived

The House divided on Motion No. 22, which was negatived on the following division:

*(Division No. 141)*

**YEAS**

**Members**

Allmand	Anawak
Angus	Assad
Axworthy (Saskatoon—Clark's Crossing)	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Barrett	Bélair
Bellemare	Berger
Bevilacqua	Black
Blackburn (Brant)	Blondin
Boudria	Catterall
Clancy	Comuzzi
Dingwall	Dionne
Ferguson	Fisher
Fis	Fontana
Foster	Rulton
Gaffney	Gagliano
Gauthier	Gray (Windsor West)
Harb	Harvard
Howlebo	Hunter
Jordan	Karpoff
Keyes	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Langan (Mission—Coquitlam)
Langdon (Essex—Windsor)	Laporte
LeBlanc (Cape Breton Highlands—Canso)	Lee
MacAulay	Maheu
Manley	McLaughlin
Mifflin	Miliken
Mills	Mitchell
Murphy	Nault
Nystrom	Ouellet
Parker	Peterson
Phinney	Proud
Prud'homme	Ris
Robinson	Rompkey
Skelly (Comox—Alberni)	Stewart
Taylor	Tobin
Vanclief	Venne
Waddell	Wappel
Whittaker	Wood—74

**NAYS**

**Members**

Anderson	Andre
Atkinson	Attewell
Beatty	Belsher
Bernier	Bird
Blackburn (Jonquière)	Blenkarn
Bourgault	Boyer
Brightwell	Browes
Cadieux	Campbell (Vancouver Centre)
Cardiff	Casey
Chadwick	Champagne (Champlain)
Chartrand	Clark (Brandon—Souris)
Clifford	Cole
Collins	Cook
Cooper	Corbell
Côté	Couture
Darling	DeBlois
de Cotret	Desjardins
Dick	Dobbie
Domm	Dorin
Edwards	Epp
Fee	Feltham
Ferland	Fontaine
Fretz	Friesen
Gibeau	Gray (Bonaventure—Îles-de-la-Madeleine)
Greene	Guilbault
Gustafson	Hawkes

*Supply*

Hockin	Horner
Hughes	Jacques
Jelinek	Johnson
Joncas	Jourdenais
Kempling	Koury
Lendry	Langlois
Larrivée	Layton
Lewis	Loiselle
Lopez	Marin
Masse	Mazankowski
McCreath	McDermid
McDougall (St. Paul's)	McLean
Moore	Muroney
Nicholson	Oberle
O'Kurley	Paproski
Plourde	Porter
Redway	Reid
Reimer	Ricard
Richardson	Roy-Arcelin
Saint-Julien	Schneider
Scott (Victoria—Haliburton)	Scott (Hamilton—Wentworth)
Shields	Sobieski
Soetens	Sparrow
Stevenson	Tardif
Tétreault	Thacker
Thompson	Thorkelson
Tremblay (Québec—Est)	Tremblay (Lotbinière)
Turner (Halton—Peel)	Van De Walle
Vankoughnet	Vien
Vincent	Weiner
White	Wibee
Wilson (Swift Current—Maple Creek—Assiniboia)	Winegard
Wilson (Etobicoke Centre)	
Worthy—118	

**PAIRED—MEMBERS**

nil/aucun

Motion No. 22 negatived.

Hon. Doug Lewis (Solicitor General of Canada) moved that the bill, as amended, be concurred in.

The House divided on the motion which was agreed to on the following division:

*(Division No. 142)*

**YEAS**

**Members**

Anderson	Andre
Atkinson	Attewell
Beatty	Belsher
Bernier	Bird
Blackburn (Jonquière)	Blenkarn
Bourgault	Boyer
Brightwell	Browes
Cadieux	Campbell (Vancouver Centre)
Cardiff	Casey
Chadwick	Champagne (Champlain)
Chartrand	Clark (Brandon—Souris)
Clifford	Cole
Collins	Cook
Cooper	Corbell
Côté	Couture
Darling	DeBlois

*Supply*

de Cotret	Desjardins	Arworthy (Saskatoon—Clark's Crossing)	Arworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Dick	Dobbie	Barrett	Bélair
Domm	Dorin	Bellemare	Berger
Edwards	Epp	Bevilacqua	Black
Fee	Feltham	Blackburn (Brant)	Blondin
Ferland	Fontaine	Boudria	Catterall
Fretz	Friesen	Clancy	Comuzzi
Gibeau	Gray (Bonaventure—Îles-de-la-Madeleine)	Dingwall	Dionne
Greene	Guilbault	Ferguson	Fisher
Gustafson	Hawkes	Fils	Fontana
Hockin	Horner	Foster	Fulton
Hughes	Jacques	Gaffney	Gagliano
Jelinek	Johnson	Gauthier	Gray (Windsor West)
Joncas	Jourdenais	Harb	Harvard
Kemping	Koury	Howebo	Hunter
Landry	Langlois	Jordan	Karpoff
Larivière	Layton	Keyes	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas)
Lewis	Loiselle	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Langan (Mission—Coquitlam)
Lopez	Marin	Langdon (Essex—Windsor)	Laporte
Masse	Mazankowski	LeBlanc (Cape Breton Highlands—Canso)	Lee
McCreath	McDermid	MacAulay	Maheu
McDougall (St. Paul's)	McLean	Manley	McLaughlin
Moore	Mulroney	Miffin	Milliken
Nicholson	Oberle	Mills	Mitchell
O'Kurley	Paproski	Murphy	Nault
Piourde	Porter	Nystrom	Ouellet
Redway	Reid	Parker	Peterson
Reimer	Ricard	Phinney	Proud
Richardson	Roy-Arcelin	Prud'homme	Ris
Saint-Julien	Schneider	Robinson	Rompkey
Scott (Victoria—Haliburton)	Scott (Hamilton—Wentworth)	Skelly (Comox—Alberni)	Stewart
Shields	Sobeski	Taylor	Tobin
Soetens	Sparrow	Vanclief	Venne
Stevenson	Tardif	Waddell	Wappel
Tétreault	Thacker	Whittaker	Wood—74
Thompson	Thorkelson		
Tremblay (Québec—Est)	Tremblay (Lotbinière)		
Turner (Halton—Peel)	Van De Walle		
Vankoughnet	Vien		
Vincent	Weiner		
White	Wilbes		
Wilson (Swift Current—Maple Creek—Assiniboia)	Winegard		
Wilson (Etobicoke Centre)			
Worthy—118			

**NAYS**

Members  
Anawak  
Assad

Allmand  
Angus

**PAIRED—MEMBERS**

ni/aucun

Motion agreed to.

**Mr. Speaker:** It being 6.30 o'clock p.m., this House stands adjourned until tomorrow at 10 o'clock a.m., pursuant to Standing Order 24(1).

The House adjourned at 6.33 p.m.