Report of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee on
Charge Screening, Disclosure, and Resolution Discussions

The Honourable G. Arthur Martin, O.C., O.Ont., Q.C., LL.D. Chair
Advisory Committee to the Attorney General on Screening of Criminal Charges, Resolution Discussions and Disclosure

The Honourable G. Arthur Martin, O.C., O. Ont., Q.C., LL.D.
Chair

Mr. B. Lee Baig, Q.C.
Committee Member

Mr. Joe DeFilippis
Committee Member

Superintendent Wayne Frechette
Committee Member

Mr. S. Casey Hill
Committee Member

Inspector Rolly MacDonald
Committee Member

Mr. Daniel M. Mitchell
Committee Member

Mr. W. Brian Trafford, Q.C.
Committee Member

Mr. D. Fletcher Dawson
Committee Member

Chief Julian Fantino
Committee Member

Ms. Mary Hall
Committee Member

Mr. Earl Levy, Q.C.
Committee Member

Ms. Katherine McLeod
Committee Member

Staff Sgt. Alfred W. Oakley
Committee Member

Ms. Beverly Ward
Committee Member

David Butt
Researcher
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 1

The Mandate and Proceedings of the Committee ...................... 1

CHAPTER I: AN OVERVIEW OF THE ISSUES BEFORE THE COMMITTEE . 11

A. The Importance of the Early Stages of the Criminal Process ............................................. 11

B. Criminal Procedure and the Early Stages of the Criminal Process ........................................... 20

C. Principal Aspects of the Committee's Recommendations .................. 25

1. The Role and Responsibility of Counsel and the Police ................................................. 25

2. The Need for Sound Organization and Management .............................................................. 41

CHAPTER II: CHARGE SCREENING ............................................. 51

A. The Threshold Test for Commencing or Continuing a Prosecution ........................................ 51

1. The Threshold Standards or Tests Currently Applied .......................................................... 52

2. The *Prima Facie* Case Threshold Test ................................................................. 55

3. The Proposed Standard of the Law Reform Commission of Canada ..................................... 59

4. The Committee's Formulation of the Threshold Test .......................................................... 60

5. The Threshold Test and the Public Interest ................................................................. 74
6. Various Public Interest Factors that May be Relevant ........................................... 77

The Gravity of the Incident ................................................................. 78

Political Consequences ................................................................. 80

The Victim ......................................................................................... 82

The Availability of Compensation, Restitution, or Reparation ............. 87

The Status in Life of the Accused or Victim ......................................... 89

Public Confidence and Public Order ................................................. 92

National Security and International Relations .................................. 95

Alternatives to Prosecution .............................................................. 96

Other Factors .................................................................................. 99

7. The Scope of the Threshold Test .................................................... 104

8. The Threshold Test and Policies, Directives, and Guidelines in General ........................................ 104

B. Should There Be Charge Screening in Ontario? .......................... 113

C. Should Charge Screening Be Pre- or Post-Charge? ...................... 120

D. The Mechanics of Post-Charge Screening ..................................... 127

1. The Timing of Post-Charge Screening .......................................... 128

2. Information Required by the Crown for Charge Screening ........... 130

3. The Flow of Information Between Crown Counsel and the Police 133
4. Other Aspects of Post-Charge Screening ........................................ 136
5. The Personnel Implications of Post-Charge Screening ....................... 141

CHAPTER III: DISCLOSURE ......................................................... 143

A. The Evolution of Disclosure in Ontario ........................................ 144
B. The Stinchcombe Case .................................................................. 145
C. The Committee’s Approach to Disclosure ........................................ 149
D. General Recommendations With Respect to Disclosure .................... 150
   1. Disclosure Recommendations Pertaining to Investigations ............... 150
   2. Ethical and Legal Obligations Relating to Disclosure ..................... 166
      The Police ........................................................................ 167
      Crown Counsel ................................................................. 170
      Defence Counsel ............................................................... 175
   3. Disclosure and Summary Conviction Offences ............................... 184
   4. Other Recommendations ....................................................... 189
E. Recommendations Relevant to a Proposed New Disclosure Directive .... 193
   1. Purpose and General Principles of Disclosure .............................. 195
      Possession and Control ...................................................... 197
The Meaning of "Relevant" for Disclosure Purposes ................. 199

Limitations on the Use of Information for Impeachment Purposes ........................................ 202

The Represented Accused .................................................. 217

The Unrepresented Accused .............................................. 218

2. Particular Requirements ................................................ 221

Criminal Records of Witnesses ......................................... 238

F. Implementing Disclosure ............................................... 262

1. Police Disclosure to the Crown ..................................... 264

2. Paying for Disclosure .................................................. 266

3. Disclosure and Accused Persons in Custody ...................... 273

CHAPTER IV: RESOLUTION DISCUSSIONS ............................... 275

A. The Development of Resolution Discussions .................... 275

B. Recommendations Regarding Resolution Discussions ........ 291

1. Recommendations Relating to the Conduct of Resolution Discussions ..................................... 291

2. Recommendations Concerning Courtroom Practice Following Resolution Discussions ............. 315

C. Procedural Aspects of Resolution Discussions ................. 334

D. Pre-Hearing Conferences .............................................. 348
CONCLUDING RECOMMENDATION ........................................... 387

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A: The Mandate of the Committee .................................. 391

APPENDIX B: Disclosure Policy Statement .................................... 395

APPENDIX C: Issues: Charge Screening, Disclosure,
Resolution Discussions .................................................. 397

APPENDIX D: Invitees for Consultation ....................................... 405

APPENDIX E: Submissions Received ........................................... 413

APPENDIX F: Invitees for Consultation - By Location ..................... 417

APPENDIX G: Persons Who Made Oral Submissions ....................... 431

APPENDIX H: Issues: Charge Screening, Disclosure,
Resolution Discussions - Revised for the Judiciary ..................... 435

APPENDIX I: Study of the Cost of Disclosure .............................. 443

APPENDIX J: Summary of the Committee's Recommendations ........... 461

APPENDIX K: Windsor Joint Forces Court Services: A Successful
Approach to the Early Stages of the Criminal Process .................. 481

APPENDIX L: Financial Analysis of the Committee's
Recommendations ......................................................... 497