

**“Source: *Immunity from Execution,*
Administrative Law Series, Study Paper, 1987.
Department of Justice Canada.
Reproduced with the permission of the Minister of Public
Works and Government Services Canada, 2007.”**

Table of Contents

INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER ONE: Existence of This Extraordinary Privilege	5
Section I: Express Recognition of Immunity from Execution	5
I. The Dual Source of Immunity from Execution	5
A. Legislative Codification	6
B. Recognition of the State's Special Pre-eminence	8
1. Monopoly of Constraint	9
2. The Budgetary Authorization Rule	11
3. The Idea of Special Pre-eminence	12
(a) Paramountcy of the Executive	12
(b) Primacy of the General Interest	13
II. Favourable Judicial Interpretations of Immunity from Execution	14
Section II: Absence of Legal Safeguards relating to the Execution of Judgments	18
I. The Phenomenon of Non-Compliance with Judgments	19
A. Limits of the Existing Legal Regime	19
B. Types of Administrative Response	21
1. Overt Resistance	21
2. Passive Resistance	22
(a) Delay	22
(b) Incomplete Execution	23
3. Administrative Alternatives to Non-Compliance	24
(a) The Practice of Ratification	24
(b) Reconfirmation of a Vacated Decision	26
(c) Unilateral Changes to the Circumstances in Dispute	28
II. The Ineffectiveness of Alternatives to Compulsory Execution	30
A. Passive or Non-Executory Remedies	30
1. <i>Res Judicata</i>	30
2. Declaratory Judgment	32
B. Active or Executory Remedies	34
1. Mandatory Remedies	34
(a) Problems with the Injunction	35
(i) Parties Defendant	35
(ii) Criteria of Availability	37
(b) The Limits of Mandamus	38

2. Punitive Remedies	39
(a) Contempt of Court	39
(b) Damages	42
Conclusion to Chapter One	44
CHAPTER TWO: Reappraising Immunity from Execution	45
Section I: Existence of a Reform Movement	45
I. Developments in Other Countries	46
A. The Situation in the United States	46
1. Survival of Sovereign Immunity	46
2. The California Reform	49
B. The French Reform of 1980	51
1. <i>Astreinte</i> in Administrative Law	52
(a) The Unorthodox Character of <i>Astreinte</i>	52
(b) Conditions of Application	53
2. Evaluation of <i>Astreinte</i> in the Reform of Canadian Law	55
(a) Absence of a Principle of <i>Astreinte</i> in Canadian Law	55
(b) Comparison with Contempt of Court Proceedings	56
II. Academic Commentary	57
Section II: The Reality of Modern Administration	59
I. The Problem Defined	59
A. Pitfalls of the Egalitarian Approach	60
B. Characterizing Administrative Action	63
1. A Purposive Distinction	63
2. Criteria for Distinguishing the Public from the Commercial	66
II. Recognizing a Right to Execution	67
A. Potential Solutions	68
1. Indirect Means	68
2. Direct Means	70
(a) Legitimacy of Compulsion	70
(b) Penal or Civil Sanction?	71
B. Strategies for Reform	72
1. The Search for Effective Execution Remedies	72
2. The Special Case of Compensation (Set-Offs)	76
Conclusion to Chapter Two	79
GENERAL CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	81
BIBLIOGRAPHY	91
TABLE OF CASES	99
TABLE OF STATUTES	103