

CONTENTS

Foreword.....	1
---------------	---

I

The State of Canadian Law Relating to Discovery in Criminal Cases

Introduction.....	7
Discovery of the Prosecution by the Defence.....	7
1. Discovery Provisions in the <i>Criminal Code</i> and Other Statutes.....	7
(a) The Preliminary Inquiry.....	8
(b) Section 531 of the <i>Criminal Code</i>	10
(c) Section 524 of the <i>Criminal Code</i>	11
(d) Section 532 of the <i>Criminal Code</i>	14
(e) Section 533 of the <i>Criminal Code</i>	14
(f) Section 10 of the <i>Canada Evidence Act</i>	15
(g) Section 516 of the <i>Criminal Code</i>	16
(h) Notice.....	16
2. Common Law Rules.....	17
(a) Prosecutorial Discretion in the Presentation of Evidence.....	17
(b) The Use of Previous Statements of Persons Who Will Be Called as Witnesses.....	18
The Discretionary Rule.....	19
The Rule for "Refreshing Memory".....	19
3. Conclusion.....	20
Prosecutorial Discovery of the Defence.....	20
1. Discovery of Incriminating Information.....	21
(a) Section 183(1) of the <i>Criminal Code</i>	21
(b) Section 455.4 of the <i>Criminal Code</i>	22
(c) The Preliminary Inquiry and the Grand Jury.....	23
(d) Administrative Tribunals, Coroners Inquests and Statements Required by Statute.....	24
(e) Breathalyzer Legislation.....	24
2. Discovery of Actual Defences.....	25
(a) Disclosure of Alibi.....	25
Conclusion to Part I.....	28

II

The Theory of Discovery

The Aim of the Criminal Process and Discovery.....	35
The Adversary Model of the Criminal Process and Discovery.....	36
1. The Adversary System.....	37

2. The Adversary Trial System and Discovery.....	38
3. Guilty Pleas and Discovery.....	40
Arguments Concerning Discovery in Criminal Procedure.....	41
1. Prosecution and the Accused: Does Discovery upset the balance of advantage?.....	42
2. Discovery and Reciprocity: Should Discovery to the accused be denied since it cannot be made reciprocal because of the principle against compulsory self-incrimination?.....	45
3. Perjury and Witness Intimidation: Does Discovery create such opportunities for distortion of the criminal process that it should not be allowed?.....	47
4. Discovery and Efficiency: Will Discovery to the accused unduly interfere with the efficiency of the criminal process?.....	51

III

Policy Questions as to Discovery in Criminal Procedure	
Should Discovery be Discretionary or Formal?.....	59
1. Prosecutorial Discretion.....	60
2. Judicial Discretion.....	61
3. A Formal System.....	63
Integration of a Discovery System Within the Existing Pre-Trial System: Discovery and the Preliminary Inquiry.....	64
1. Background of the Preliminary Inquiry.....	64
2. Can the Preliminary Inquiry Still Serve the Purpose for Which it Was Established?.....	66
3. Does the Preliminary Inquiry Serve Other Purposes besides Determining Committal for Trial?.....	67
4. Would the Collateral Functions Fulfilled by the Preliminary Inquiry be Better Fulfilled by a Different Proceeding?.....	70
5. Two Possible Ways of Integrating a Pre-Trial Discovery Proceeding Into the Present System.....	71
(a) Retention of the Preliminary Inquiry.....	71
Uniformity: extension of the preliminary inquiry to cover all offences.....	71
Non-uniformity: improvement of the preliminary inquiry and setting up a different proceeding for cases where the preliminary inquiry is not available.....	72
(b) Abolition of the Preliminary Inquiry.....	72

IV

Sanctions	
Sanctions Related to Substantive Law.....	77
Sanctions Related to the Rules of Evidence.....	78
1. Judicial Comment.....	78
2. Inadmissibility of Evidence.....	78

Procedural Sanctions.....	79
1. Adjournalment of the Trial.....	79
2. Prerogative Writs: Mandamus.....	80
Discretion of the Trial Judge.....	80

V

Issues as to Prosecutorial Discovery

The Arguments Both For and Against Prosecutorial Discovery of the Accused.....	83
Notice of Alibi and Expert Evidence.....	93
The Present State of Prosecutorial Discovery in Some Other Jurisdictions....	95
Conclusion.....	99

VI

Procedural Models for Reform of Pre-Trial Discovery in Criminal Cases

The Omnibus Hearing.....	106
1. Description.....	106
2. Tentative Evaluation of the Omnibus Hearing.....	110
Israel.....	115
1. Description.....	115
2. Tentative Evaluation of the Israeli Model.....	119
Vermont.....	120
1. Description.....	120
2. Tentative Evaluation of the Vermont Model.....	122
Combination of Other American Models.....	126
Proposed Model of Harvard Journal of Legislation, 1966.....	126
United States Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure as Amended to 1968.....	126
American Bar Association: Standards on Discovery and Procedure Before Trial, October 1970.....	126
Oregon: Proposed Code of Criminal Procedure, November 1972.....	126
Tennessee: Proposed Code of Criminal Procedure, January 1973.....	126
1. Description.....	126
(a) Disclosure to the Accused.....	127
(b) Disclosure to the Prosecution.....	128
(c) Timing of Disclosure.....	129
(d) Material Not Subject to Disclosure.....	130
Work Product.....	130
Informants.....	130
National Security.....	130
(e) Protective Orders.....	131
(f) Continuing Duty to Disclose and Sanctions to Compel Disclosure.....	132
2. Tentative Evaluation of the Combination of Models.....	132

England.....	133
1. Description.....	133
(a) Developments in Statute Law.....	133
(b) Developments in Case Law and Informal Practice.....	135
In General.....	135
Statements of Witnesses to the Prosecution.....	137
Written or Oral Statements of the Accused or Co-Accused.....	138
Previous Convictions and Information With Respect to Character of Witnesses.....	139
Scientific, Forensic, and Medical Evidence and Reports.....	139
Other Documents.....	139
Right to Interview Prosecution Witnesses.....	139
The Indictment.....	140
2. Tentative Evaluation of the English Model.....	140
Conclusion.....	142

VII

Proposal for Reform	
Specific Provisions For A Discovery System.....	152
I. Discovery Procedures.....	152
1. Application of Discovery.....	152
2. Pre-Plea Discovery.....	153
3. Questioning Validity of Plea.....	155
4. Use of Pre-Plea Discovery Statement.....	156
5. Procedure if Plea of Not Guilty Entered.....	156
6. Scheduling Discovery Meeting and Discovery Hearing.....	156
7. Discovery Meeting Summary Memorandum.....	159
8. Period Between Discovery Meeting and Discovery Hearing.....	160
9. Functions of Judge at Discovery Hearing.....	160
10. Additional Powers or functions of Judge at Discovery Hearing..	163
11. Procedure Upon Non-Disclosure of Identity of Potential Wit- nesses by the Prosecution.....	163
12. Procedure Upon Defence Request for Attendance of Disclosed Witnesses for pre-trial Questioning Under Oath.....	164
13. Questioning Committal For Trial.....	166
14. Sanctions.....	168
15. Continuing Duty to Disclose.....	169
II. Material and Information Subject to Discovery.....	169
1. Duty of Prosecution to Inform Itself and Obtain Relevant Material	169
2. Information and Material to be Disclosed in Pre-Plea Discovery....	169
3,4. Material and Information to be Disclosed Upon Plea of Not Guilty or Where the Accused is to be Tried in a Higher Court.....	171
5. Material and Information Not Subject to Disclosure.....	176
6. Excision.....	178

Problems Relating to the Implementation of the Discovery Proposal and the Present Structure of the Courts of Criminal Jurisdiction.....	179
1. Utilization of Provincial Court Judges.....	179
(a) Decisions of Provincial Court Judges at the Discovery Hearing Would be Final and Would Bind the Trial Judge.....	179
(b) Decisions of Provincial Court Judges Would Not be Final and Could be Reviewed by the Trial Judge.....	180
(c) Mixed Formula: Certain Decisions Would be Final, Others Would be Subject to Review by the Trial Judge.....	180
2. Each Level of Jurisdiction Would Control Its Own Pre-Trial Procedures.....	181
3. Unification of Criminal Courts.....	182
Prosecutorial Discovery of the Accused.....	183
Statement of Position and Comment.....	183

VIII

Bibliography.....	187
Appendix A.....	201
1. Omnibus Hearing Checklist Presently in Use in the Southern District of California.....	201
2. Waiver of Omnibus Hearing Form Presently in Use in the Southern District of California.....	207
Appendix B.....	209
1. Omnibus Hearing Checklist Presently in Use in the Western District of Texas.....	209