

# **MILITARY LAW AND OPERATIONS**

**Dr. Chris Madsen**  
**Royal Military College of Canada and  
Canadian Forces College**

*Volume 1*

(Chapter 1 through Courts Martial in 2000)

**CANADA LAW BOOK®**

September 2011

© 2011 Thomson Reuters Canada Limited

**NOTICE AND DISCLAIMER:** All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written consent of the publisher (Canada Law Book).

Canada Law Book and all persons involved in the preparation and sale of this publication disclaim any warranty as to accuracy or currency of the publication. This publication is provided on the understanding and basis that none of Canada Law Book, the author/s or other persons involved in the creation of this publication shall be responsible for the accuracy or currency of the contents, or for the results of any action taken on the basis of the information contained in this publication, or for any errors or omissions contained herein.

No one involved in this publication is attempting herein to render legal, accounting, or other professional advice. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought. The analysis contained herein should in no way be construed as being either official or unofficial policy of any governmental body.

**A cataloguing record for this publication is available from Library and Archives Canada.**

**ISSN 1918-2236**

Printed in Canada



**THOMSON REUTERS**

**CANADA LAW BOOK, A DIVISION OF THOMSON REUTERS CANADA LIMITED**

One Corporate Plaza  
2075 Kennedy Road  
Toronto, Ontario M1T 3V4  
Canada

Customer Relations  
Toronto 1-416-609-3800  
Elsewhere in Canada/U.S. 1-800-387-5164  
Fax 1-416-298-5082  
[www.canadalawbook.ca](http://www.canadalawbook.ca)  
E-mail [www.carswell.com/email](http://www.carswell.com/email)

# Table of Contents

## *Volume 1*

<i>Dedication</i> .....	D-1
<i>Preface</i> .....	P-1
<i>Contents Checklist</i> .....	CL-1
<i>Table of Cases</i> .....	TC-1

**PART 1        DEFENCE, ARMED FORCES AND  
MILITARY LAW .....PT1-1**

**Chapter 1     HISTORICAL ANTECEDENTS .....1-1**

1:10	PROVISION OF DEFENCE AND SECURITY IN A NEW DOMINION.....	1-1
1:10.10	Pre-Confederation .....	1-2
1:10.20	Post-Confederation.....	1-3
1:10.20(a)	1868 Militia Act .....	1-3
1:10.20(b)	1885 North-West Rebellion .....	1-7
1:10.20(c)	South African (Boer) War .....	1-8
1:10.20(d)	1904 Militia Act .....	1-9
1:20	CANADIANS IN THE FIRST WORLD WAR.....	1-11
1:20.10	1917 Military Service Act.....	1-12
1:20.20	Toward National Armed Forces.....	1-13
1:30	FIRST ATTEMPTS AT DEFENCE ORGANIZATION AND CONSOLIDATION.....	1-14
1:30.10	National Defence Act, 1922 .....	1-14
1:30.20	1933 Visiting Forces (British Commonwealth) Act .....	1-15
1:30.30	Canadian Command and Control in the Second World War .....	1-17
1:30.40	1940 Royal Canadian Air Force Act.....	1-17
1:30.50	1944 Naval Service Act.....	1-18
1:40	COLD WAR YEARS .....	1-20
1:40.10	Justification for Sounder National Defence Legislation .....	1-21
1:40.20	1950 National Defence Act .....	1-23
1:40.30	Rearmament, Korea and Cold War Roles .....	1-27
1:50	UNIFICATION.....	1-30

1:50.10	1964 “Act to Amend the National Defence Act”.....	1-31
1:50.20	1967 Canadian Forces Reorganization Act.....	1-33
1:50.30	The Canadian Forces.....	1-35
1:60	RESPONDING TO THE TROUBLES OF THE 1990s .....	1-36
1:60.10	Somalia and Its Aftermath.....	1-36
1:60.20	1998 “Act to Amend the National Defence Act”.....	1-38
1:60.30	Bill C-7: “An Act to Amend the National Defence Act”.....	1-40
1:60.40	Bill C-41: Strengthening Military Justice in the Defence of Canada Act .....	1-42

**Chapter 2 MILITARY JUSTICE.....2-1**

2:10	THE PURPOSE AND EFFECT OF MILITARY LAW.....	2-1
2:10.10	A Separate Military Justice System.....	2-2
2:10.20	R. v. MacKay.....	2-4.1
2:10.30	R. v. Généreux.....	2-6
2:10.40	R. v. Forster.....	2-9
2:20	JUDGE ADVOCATE GENERAL.....	2-10
2:20.10	Custody and Investigation.....	2-15
2:20.20	Summary Trial.....	2-17
2:20.30	Courts Martial.....	2-20
2:20.30(a)	Military Judiciary.....	2-26
2:20.30(b)	Military Sentencing.....	2-38.2
2:20.40	Review and Appeal.....	2-45

**Chapter 3 CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT .....3-1**

3:10	CANADA’S MILITARY IN A PARLIAMENTARY DEMOCRACY.....	3-1
3:20	CIVILIAN CONTROL OVER THE MILITARY.....	3-3
3:20.10	Prime Minister and Cabinet .....	3-7
3:20.20	Minister of National Defence .....	3-9
3:20.20(a)	Deputy Minister of National Defence .....	3-12
3:20.20(b)	Chief Review Services.....	3-12.1
3:20.30	Parliament .....	3-12.3
3:20.40	Auditor General of Canada.....	3-16
3:20.50	Military Police Complaints Commission.....	3-18
3:20.60	Canadian Forces Grievance Board.....	3-22
3:20.70	Department of National Defence and the Canadian Forces Ombudsman.....	3-25
3:20.80	Public Commissions of Inquiry.....	3-26
3:20.90	Federal Courts.....	3-28
3:20.100	Communications Security Establishment and the Communications Security Establishment Commissioner.....	3-30

TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Chapter 4 LEGAL ISSUES IN THE CANADIAN FORCES .....4-1**

4:10 THE MILITARY, SOCIAL CHANGE AND THE LAW .....4-1  
4:10.10 Sex and Gender in the Canadian Forces .....4-2  
4:20 LIABILITIES OF SERVICE .....4-3  
4:20.10 Involuntary Vaccination .....4-6.1  
4:20.20 Military Unionism.....4-8  
4:20.30 Job Protection for Military Reservists.....4-15  
4:30 FITNESS STANDARDS.....4-25  
4:30.10 Continued Service and Release .....4-29  
4:40 AGE DISCRIMINATION .....4-35  
4:50 DISABILITY AND DEATH.....4-37  
4:50.10 Post-Conflict Entitlements and Treatment .....4-39  
4:50.10(a) Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder .....4-43  
4:50.10(b) Suicide.....4-49  
4:50.20 Preparing for the Eventuality of Death .....4-52  
4:50.30 Financial Benefits Accruing to Survivors.....4-53  
4:60 GENDER INTEGRATION .....4-54  
4:60.10 Sexual Harassment .....4-56  
4:60.20 Sexual Relations and Sexual Assault.....4-61  
4:60.30 Publication Bans Hide Military Sexual Assaults.....4-66.3  
4:60.40 Punishing Sexual Assault in the Canadian Forces .....4-69  
4:70 SEXUAL ORIENTATION.....4-72  
4:70.10 Military Homosexuality Comes Before the Courts .....4-72  
4:70.20 Homosexuality in the Canadian Forces.....4-74  
4:80 SPOUSAL ABUSE .....4-78  
4:90 PORNOGRAPHY .....4-82  
4:90.10 Pornography and Appropriate Computer Usage in the  
Military Context .....4-83  
4:90.20 Uncovering Pornography Consumers in the Military.....4-85  
4:90.30 Child Pornography .....4-86

**PART 2 LEGAL DIMENSIONS OF OPERATIONS ....PT2-1**

**Chapter 5 DOMESTIC VERSUS INTERNATIONAL OPERATIONS .....5-1**

5:10 MILITARY OPERATIONS .....5-1  
5:20 DOMESTIC OPERATIONS.....5-2  
5:20.10 Assistance to Other Federal Government Departments.....5-4  
5:20.20 Aid to the Civil Power.....5-8  
5:20.20(a) Military Assistance to Provincial and Territorial  
Law Enforcement .....5-8.1  
5:20.20(b) Peace Officer Status.....5-10  
5:20.20(c) Soldiers in the Streets in Support of Public Order .....5-11

5:20.30	Sovereignty .....	5-12
5:20.40	Continental Defence .....	5-13
5:30	INTERNATIONAL OPERATIONS .....	5-15
5:30.10	Nationals Evacuation .....	5-16
5:30.20	Humanitarian Relief .....	5-17
5:30.30	Peacekeeping under Chapter VI of the Charter of the United Nations .....	5-18
5:30.30(a)	United Nations Mission in Eritrea and Ethiopia .....	5-19
5:30.40	Military Intervention and Stability Operations Under Chapter VII of the Charter of the United Nations .....	5-20
5:30.40(a)	United Nations Organization Mission in the Democratic Republic of the Congo .....	5-21
5:30.40(b)	Canadian Engagement in Afghanistan .....	5-23
<b>Chapter 6 STATUS OF FORCES .....</b>		<b>6-1</b>
6:10	CONVENTIONAL AND UNCONVENTIONAL PARTICIPANTS IN CONFLICT .....	6-1
6:20	STATUS OF FORCES AGREEMENTS (SOFAs) .....	6-4
6:20.10	North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) SOFA .....	6-2
6:20.20	United Nations SOFAs .....	6-4
6:20.30	Use of Memorandum of Understanding for Operational Deployments .....	6-5
6:30	COMBATANTS .....	6-5
6:30.10	Extending Combatant Status Beyond Professional Armed Forces .....	6-6
6:40	UNLAWFUL COMBATANTS .....	6-8
6:40.10	Armed Civilians in Armed Conflict .....	6-10
6:40.20	Determination and Withholding of Combatant Status .....	6-13
6:40.30	Mercenaries .....	6-15
6:40.40	Pirates .....	6-16
6:40.50	Spies and Traitors .....	6-18
6:50	SPECIAL FORCES .....	6-21
6:50.10	Joint Task Force 2 .....	6-21
6:50.20	Canadian Rangers .....	6-24
6:60	CONTRACTORS .....	6-25
6:70	RETAINED PERSONNEL .....	6-27
6:80	PLENIPOTENTIARIES .....	6-29
<b>Chapter 7 USE OF FORCE .....</b>		<b>7-1</b>
7:10	LEGAL PRINCIPLES BEHIND MILITARY USE OF FORCE .....	7-1
7:10.10	Military Necessity .....	7-2
7:10.20	Proportionality .....	7-4
7:20	CANADIAN FORCES CODE OF CONDUCT .....	7-6

TABLE OF CONTENTS

7:20.10 Mercy Killing.....7-7  
 7:30 RULES OF ENGAGEMENT (ROE).....7-8.1  
 7:40 NON-DEADLY AND DEADLY FORCE.....7-12  
     7:40.10 Self-Defence.....7-13  
 7:50 TARGETING.....7-16  
     7:50.10 Friendly Fire.....7-18  
     7:50.20 Shoot-Down Authority.....7-21  
 7:60 GENERAL DALLAIRE’S DILEMMA AND FORCE IN  
     PEACE SUPPORT OPERATIONS.....7-23

**Chapter 8 PROTECTED PERSONS AND WAR CRIMES.....8-1**

8:10 CANADIAN OBLIGATIONS UNDER INTERNATIONAL  
     AND DOMESTIC LAW.....8-1  
 8:20 THE LAW OF GENEVA.....8-2  
     8:20.10 Civilians.....8-5  
         8:20.10(a) Responsibility to Protect.....8-7  
     8:20.20 Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked.....8-8  
     8:20.30 Prisoners of War.....8-10  
         8:20.30(a) Standards of Treatment.....8-11  
     8:20.40 Detainees.....8-12  
         8:20.40(a) Torture.....8-18  
         8:20.40(b) Mistreatment of Detainees on Canadian Peace  
             Support Operations.....8-19  
         8:20.40(c) Transfer of Detainees to Potential Torture in  
             Afghanistan.....8-21  
 8:30 WAR CRIMES.....8-26.1  
     8:30.10 Canada’s Historical Record with Prosecution of War  
         Crimes.....8-26.1  
     8:30.20 War Crimes and the Canadian Forces.....8-27  
 8:40 COMMAND RESPONSIBILITY.....8-29  
     8:40.10 Practical Examples of Command Responsibility in the  
         Canadian Context.....8-31  
     8:40.20 Superior Orders.....8-33  
 Index.....IN-1

**APPENDICES**

Appendix I: LEGISLATION..... APP1-1  
     Militia Act, S.C. 1868, c. 40..... APP1-3  
     National Defence Act, 1922, S.C. 1922, c. 34..... APP1-27  
     Sex Offender Information Registration Regulations (Canadian  
     Forces), SOR/2008-247..... APP1-29  
     Military Rules of Evidence, C.R.C. 1978, c. 1049..... APP1-33  
     Royal Canadian Air Force Act, S.C. 1940, c. 15..... APP1-65

Court Martial Appeal Court Rules, SOR/86-959 .....	APP1-71
Visiting Forces (British Commonwealth) Act, 1933, S.C. 1933, c. 21 .....	APP1-99
Court Martial Rules of Practice.....	APP1-105
Court Martial Procedures: Guide for Participants and Members of the Public, A-LG-007-000/AG-001 .....	APP1-111
Canadian Forces Members and Veterans Re-establishment and Compensation Regulations, SOR/2006-50.....	APP1-117
Other Legislation Relevant to the Armed Forces .....	APP1-139
Appendix 2: COURTS MARTIAL LISTS.....	APP2-1
Registered Court Martial Appeals .....	APP2-3
Registered Court Martial Appeals Names Index .....	APP2-19
Courts Martial – Sequential Citation .....	APP2-41
Courts Martial – Names Index .....	APP2-129
Courts Martial Charge Index .....	APP2-215
Courts Martial in 2011 .....	APP2:2011-1
Courts Martial in 2010 .....	APP2:2010-1
Courts Martial in 2009 .....	APP2:2009-1
Courts Martial in 2008 .....	APP2:2008-1
Courts Martial in 2007 .....	APP2:2007-1
Courts Martial in 2006 .....	APP2:2006-1
Courts Martial in 2005 .....	APP2:2005-1
Courts Martial in 2004 .....	APP2:2004-1
Courts Martial in 2003 .....	APP2:2003-1
Courts Martial in 2002 .....	APP2:2002-1
Courts Martial in 2001 .....	APP2:2001-1
Courts Martial in 2000 .....	APP2:2000-1

## *Volume 2*

Courts Martial in 1999 .....	APP2:1999-1
Courts Martial in 1998 .....	APP2:1998-1
Courts Martial in 1997 .....	APP2:1997-1
Courts Martial in 1996 .....	APP2:1996-1
Courts Martial in 1995 .....	APP2:1995-1
Courts Martial in 1994 .....	APP2:1994-1
Courts Martial in 1993 .....	APP2:1993-1
Courts Martial in 1992 .....	APP2:1992-1
Courts Martial in 1991 .....	APP2:1991-1
Courts Martial in 1990 .....	APP2:1990-1
Courts Martial in 1989 .....	APP2:1989-1
Courts Martial in 1988 .....	APP2:1988-1
Courts Martial in 1987 .....	APP2:1987-1
Courts Martial in 1986 .....	APP2:1986-1



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Courts Martial in 1985 .....	APP2:1985-1
Courts Martial in 1984 .....	APP2:1984-1
Courts Martial in 1983 .....	APP2:1983-1
Courts Martial in 1982 .....	APP2:1982-1
Courts Martial in 1981 .....	APP2:1981-1
Courts Martial in 1980 .....	APP2:1980-1
Courts Martial in 1979 .....	APP2:1979-1
Courts Martial in 1978 .....	APP2:1978-1
Courts Martial in 1977 .....	APP2:1977-1
Courts Martial in 1976 .....	APP2:1976-1
Courts Martial in 1975 .....	APP2:1975-1
Courts Martial in 1974 .....	APP2:1974-1
Courts Martial in 1973 .....	APP2:1973-1
Courts Martial in 1972 .....	APP2:1972-1
Appendix 3: DIGESTS .....	APP3-1
R. v. MacKay .....	APP3-2.2
R. v. Généreux .....	APP3-3
R. v. Forster .....	APP3-7
R. v. Kipling .....	APP3-9
Canada (Human Rights Commission) v. Canada (Armed Forces) .....	APP3-10
Stopford v. Canada .....	APP3-11
Marsot v. Canada (Department of National Defence) .....	APP3-12
Douglas v. Canada .....	APP3-13
R. v. Forsyth .....	APP3-14
R. v. Dixon .....	APP3-15
R. v. Trépanier .....	APP3-16
R. v. Billard .....	APP3-18
R. v. Borsch .....	APP3-19
Amnesty International Canada v. Canadian Forces (Chief of the Defence Staff) .....	APP3-21
Amnesty International Canada v. Canadian Forces (Chief of the Defence Staff) .....	APP3-22
Forster v. MacDonald .....	APP3-23
Price v. Canada (Attorney General) .....	APP3-24
Hamm v. Canada .....	APP3-25
Jones v. Canada (Attorney General) .....	APP3-28
Cramb v. Canada (Attorney General) .....	APP3-29
Bernath v. Canada .....	APP3-30
Duplessis v. Canada .....	APP3-33
Price v. Canada (Attorney General) .....	APP3-34
Canadian Broadcasting Corp. v. Boland .....	APP3-35
Brownhall v. Canada (Ministry of National Defence) .....	APP3-37
R. v. Ribic .....	APP3-38

Canada (Director of Military Prosecutions) v. Canada (Court Martial Administrator).....	APP3-39
Amnesty International Canada v. Canadian Forces (Chief of the Defence Staff) .....	APP3-40
Mounted Police Assn. of Ontario v. Canada (Attorney General)...	APP3-42
Delisle v. Canada (Deputy Attorney General).....	APP3-45
Gostlow v. Canada (Armed Forces).....	APP3-47
R. v. McEachern.....	APP3-48
Prentice v. Canada (Royal Canadian Mounted Police) .....	APP3-50
Jones v. Canada (Attorney General) .....	APP3-52
Dixon v. Canada (Commission of Inquiry into the Deployment of Canadian Forces to Somalia).....	APP3-53
Liebmann v. Canada (Minister of National Defence) .....	APP3-55
Canada (Attorney General) v. Amnesty International Canada .....	APP3-57
Balogun v. Canada (Minister of National Defence).....	APP3-58
Patterson v. Canada (Attorney General) .....	APP3-59
R. v. Savage .....	APP3-60
R. v. Rohrich.....	APP3-61
Smith v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) .....	APP3-62
Smith v. Canada (Chief of the Defence Staff).....	APP3-63
R. v. Szczerbaniwicz.....	APP3-64
Acreman v. Canada (Attorney General) .....	APP3-65
Beauchene v. Canada (Attorney General).....	APP3-66
McIlroy v. Canada (Attorney General) .....	APP3-67
Manuge v. Canada .....	APP3-68
R. v. Semrau.....	APP3-70
Schmidt v. Canada (Attorney General) .....	APP3-71
<b>Appendix 4: OPERATIONAL DOCUMENTS.....</b>	<b>APP4-1</b>
Comparative Ranks in the Canadian Forces.....	APP4-3
Letter from Professor Michael Byers and Professor William Schabas to Luis Moreno-Ocampo, Prosecutor, International Criminal Court, The Hague, Netherlands (April 25, 2007).....	APP4-5
Penitentiary Assistance, P.C. 1975-131 .....	APP4-17
Canadian Forces Armed Assistance Directions, P.C. 1993-624 .....	APP4-19
Canadian Forces Assistance to Provincial Police Forces Directions, P.C. 1996-833 .....	APP4-21
Terms of Reference [for Former Chief Justice Frank Iacobucci, Independent Advisor to Review National Security Information], P.C. 2010-0295.....	APP4-25