Royal Commission on the Donald Marshall, Jr., Prosecution

Volume I: Findings and Recommendations

Chief Justice T. Alexander Hickman *Chairman*

Associate Chief Justice Lawrence A. Poitras Commissioner

The Honourable Mr. Gregory T. Evans, Q.C. *Commissioner*

December, 1989

Recommendation 38

We recommend that:

- (a) the Attorney General promulgate a clearly stated policy concerning the public interest factors which should, and should not, be considered in deciding whether to undertake or stop a prosecution even in the face of evidence which could sustain a conviction;
- (b) the factors which might arise for consideration in determining whether the public interest requires a prosecution, include:
 - (i) the triviality of the alleged offence or that it is of a "technical" nature only;
 - (ii) the age, physical health, mental health or special infirmity of an alleged offender or witness;
 - (iii) the staleness of the alleged offence;
 - (iv) the degree of culpability of the alleged offender (particularly in relation to other alleged parties to the offence);
 - (v) the likely effect of a prosecution on public order and

morale:

- (vi) the obsolescence or obscurity of the law;
- (vii) whether the prosecution would be perceived as counterproductive (such as by making a "martyr" of an alleged offender or by providing publicity to an alleged hate propagandist);
- (viii) the availability or efficacy of any alternatives to prosecution in the light of the purposes of the criminal sanction;
- (ix) the prevalence of the alleged offence and any related need for deterrence;
- (x) whether the consequences of any resulting conviction would be unduly harsh or oppressive;
- (xi) any entitlement of the State or other person to compensation, reparation or forfeiture if prosecution action is successful;
- (xii) the attitude of the victim of the alleged offence to a prosecution;
- (xiii) the likely length and expense of a trial;
- (xiv) whether the alleged offender is willing to cooperate in the investigation or prosecution of others, or the extent to which he or she has already done so;
- (xv) the likely outcome in the event of a finding of guilt, having regard to the sentencing options available to the court;
- (xvi) the necessity for the maintenance of public confidence in legislatures, courts and the administration of justice;
- (c) the factors which are to be excluded from consideration in determining whether the public interest requires a prosecution, include:
 - (i) the alleged offender's race, religion, sex, national origin, political associations, or beliefs;
 - (ii) the prosecutor's personal feelings concerning the victim or the alleged offender;
 - (iii) any partisan political advantage or disadvantage which might flow from the decision to undertake or stop a prosecution; or
 - (iv) the possible effect on the personal or professional circumstances of those responsible for the prosecution decision;
- (d) where the prosecutor decides not to undertake or to stop a prosecution by reason of a public interest factor such as those mentioned in (b), a notation of this decision be placed in the file relating to the case in question;
- (e) the Solicitor General bring the foregoing public interest factors relevant to the prosecution of offences to the attention of police forces operating within the province.