

Commission of Inquiry
into the Deployment of
Canadian Forces to Somalia



Commission d'enquête
sur le déploiement des
Forces canadiennes en Somalie

Independence in the Prosecution of Offences in the Canadian Forces Military Policing and Prosecutorial Discretion

a study prepared for
the Commission
of Inquiry into
the Deployment of
Canadian Forces
to Somalia

James W. O'Reilly
Patrick Healy



**Independence in the Prosecution of
Offences in the Canadian Forces**

**Independence in the Prosecution
of
Offences in the Canadian Forces
Military Policing and
Prosecutorial Discretion**

a study prepared for
the Commission
of Inquiry into
the Deployment of
Canadian Forces
to Somalia

**James W. O'Reilly
Patrick Healy**

© Minister of Public Works and Government Services Canada 1997
Printed and bound in Canada

Available in Canada through
your local bookseller or by mail from
Canadian Government Publishing
Ottawa, Canada K1A 0S9

Catalogue No. CP32-64/8-1997E
ISBN 0-660-17080-9

Canadian Cataloguing in Publication Data

O'Reilly, James W., 1955-

Independence in the prosecution of offences in the
Canadian Forces: military policing and prosecutorial
discretion : a study

Issued also in French under title: L'indépendance
des poursuites engagées relativement à des infractions
commises dans les Forces canadiennes.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 0-660-17080-9

Cat. no. CP32-64/8-1997E

1. Military police – Canada.
2. Courts-martial and courts of inquiry – Canada.
3. Prosecution – Canada – Decision making.
 - I. Healy, Patrick.
 - II. Commission of Inquiry into the Deployment of Canadian Forces to Somalia.
 - III. Title.

UB825.C3073 1997 355.1'3323'0971 C97-980273-3

Contents

CHAPTER ONE — INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER TWO — THE ROLE OF THE MILITARY POLICE	3
Introduction	3
Necessity	3
Trust	4
Functions	5
Order and Discipline	5
Field Operations	5
Civilian Law in the Military Context	5
Special Cases	6
Organization	6
The Legal Arrangements	7
The Administrative Arrangements	9
Deployment of Military Police	10
Defined Responsibilities	10
Policing with or without Military Police	11
Conduct and Control of Investigations	12
Commencement of an Investigation	12
Management and Conclusion of an Investigation	12
Conclusions and Recommendations	17
Recommendation One	18
Recommendation Two	18
Recommendation Three	19

vi Contents

Recommendation Four 19
Recommendation Five 19

**CHAPTER THREE — PROSECUTORIAL DISCRETION IN THE
MILITARY SETTING 21**

Introduction 21

Prosecutions in the Military Justice System 21
 The Jurisdiction of the Military Justice System 22
 The Exercise of Prosecutorial Responsibilities within
 the Military 29

The Importance of Independence in the Exercise of
Prosecution Functions in the Civilian Setting 38

Prosecutorial Discretion in Other Settings 40
 The Civilian Context 40
 Other Jurisdictions 56

Prosecutorial Discretion in the Military Setting 59
 The Significance of Independence in Military
 Prosecutions 60
 The Commanding Officer as Local Prosecutor 62
 Relevant Factors Affecting Prosecutorial Discretion
 in the Military 65

Prosecutorial Decision Making in Relation to Events in
Somalia 66

Areas of Concern 70
 The Public Interest in Military Prosecutions 70
 Multiplicity of Functions of the Commanding Officer 72
 Lack of Structure in Prosecutorial Discretion 74
 Conclusion 75

vii Contents

Conclusions and Recommendations	76
Guiding Principles	76
Recommendation Six	77
Recommendation Seven	78
Recommendation Eight	78
Recommendation Nine	80
Recommendation Ten	80
CHAPTER FOUR — SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	91
The Role of the Military Police	91
Recommendation One	91
Recommendation Two	91
Recommendation Three	91
Recommendation Four	91
Recommendation Five	92
Prosecutorial Discretion in the Military Setting	92
Recommendation Six	92
Recommendation Seven	92
Recommendation Eight	92
Recommendation Nine	92
Recommendation Ten	93
APPENDIX – GUIDELINES AND STANDARDS RELATING TO PROSECUTIONS	95
<i>Report of the Royal Commission on the Donald Marshall, Jr. Prosecution, Volume 1: Findings and Recommendations</i>	95
<i>Report of the Attorney General's Advisory Committee on Charge Screening, Disclosure and Resolution Discussions</i>	96
Department of Justice (Canada), <i>Crown Counsel Policy Manual</i>	98
United Kingdom, Crown Prosecution Service, <i>Code for Crown Prosecutors</i>	101

viii Contents

Australian Commonwealth Director of Public Prosecutions,
Prosecution Policy of the Commonwealth 105

United Nations Guidelines on the Role of Prosecutors 110

NOTES 113