

PLEA BARGAINING AND SENTENCING GUIDELINES

**Simon Verdun-Jones and Alison Hatch
Simon Fraser University
1988**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary	iii
Introduction	1
Plea Bargaining in the United States	3
Attempts to Abolish Plea Bargaining	4
Re-Structuring Plea Bargaining	7
Hydraulic Theory of Discretion	7
Plea Bargaining In Canada	9
Official Standards and Guidelines	9
Legislative Guidelines	9
Common Law Guidelines	10
Professional Guidelines	11
The Judicial Response	13
Broken Plea Bargains: Pre-Adjudication	14
Broken Bargains: Repudiations by Crown Appeal	15
The Tacit Judicial Response	16
Guilty Pleas	16
Withdrawal of Guilty Plea	17
Guilty Plea as a Mitigating Factor	18
Sentence Recommendations	19
Empirical Research	21

Interviews	21
Official Records	22
Observations	22
Conditions that Deter Plea Bargaining	23
Conditions that Facilitate Plea Bargaining	23
Pre-Trial Bargaining and Sentencing Guidelines	26
Empirical Studies	27
Recommendations for Controlling the Impact of Bargaining on Guidelines	32
Controlling Bargaining	32
Structuring the Guidelines to Reduce Bargaining	33
Introduction: Initial Choices	33
Voluntary vs. Mandatory Guidelines	34
Real Offence vs. Convicted Offence Sentencing	34
Guilty Plea Discount	35
Descriptive vs. Prescriptive Guidelines	36
Who Calculates Offence Scores?	37
Width of Sentence Ranges	38
Aggravating and Mitigating Factors	38
In/Out Decision	38
Consecutive and Concurrent Sentences	39

Calculation of Prior Record	39
Role of the Victim	40
Parole	40
Appendix A	
Bibliography of Pre-Trial Bargaining in Canada	41
Appendix B	
Bibliography of Empirical Studies on Plea Bargaining in the United States	45
Appendix C	
Rules for U.S. District Courts: Rule 11	49
Appendix D	
State of Washington Sentencing Reform Act of 1981	52

4

APPENDIX A

BIBLIOGRAPHY OF PRE-TRIAL BARGAINING IN CANADA¹

- Abbott, D.C. (1981).
Plea Bargaining and Related Matters. In *Selected Studies in Criminal Advocacy*. Toronto: Butterworths, p. 89-98.
- Berger, R.L. (1978).
Plea Bargaining -- Impact on the Accused. In *Selected Studies in Criminal Advocacy*. Toronto: Butterworths, p. 143-153.
- Brannigan, A. (1984).*
Crimes, Courts and Corrections: An Introduction to Crime and Social Control in Canada. Toronto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.
- Brannigan, A. and Levy, J.C. (1983).
The Legal Framework of Plea Bargaining. *Canadian Journal of Criminology*, 25: 399-419.
- Brantingham, P.L. (1981).*
The Burnaby, British Columbia Experimental Public Defender Project: An Evaluation Report, Report II: Effectiveness Analysis. Ottawa: Department of Justice.
- Brantingham, P.L.; Beavon, D.; and Brantingham, P.J. (1982).*
Analysis of Sentencing Disparity in Two Canadian Cities. Burnaby, B.C.: Department of Criminology, Simon Fraser University.
- Cohen, S.A. (1977).
Due Process of Law: The Canadian System of Criminal Justice. Toronto: Carswell.
- Cousineau, F.D. and Verdun-Jones, S.N. (1977).
Setting Standards for Canadian Criminal Courts: The Case of Plea Bargaining. Burnaby, B.C.: Department of Criminology, Simon Fraser University.
- Cousineau, F.D. and Verdun-Jones, S.N. (1979).
Evaluating Research into Plea Bargaining in Canada and the United States: Pitfalls Facing the Policy Makers. *Canadian Journal of Criminology*, 21: 293-309.
- Ericson, R.V. and Baranek, P.M. (1982).*
The Ordering of Justice: A Study of Accused Persons as Dependents in the Criminal Process. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Ferguson, G. (1972).
The Role of the Judge in Plea Bargaining. *Criminal Law Quarterly*, 15: 26-51.

¹ * denotes an empirical study.

- Ferguson, G. (1972).
Plea Bargaining in Canada. New York: CLEAR Center.
- Ferguson, G. and Roberts, D. (1974).
 Plea Bargaining: Directions for Canadian Reform. *Canadian Bar Review*, 52: 498-576.
- Friedland, M.L. (1975).
 Gun Control: The Options. *Criminal Law Quarterly*, 18: 29-71.
- Gale, G.A. (1969).
 Panel Discussion: Problems in Ethics and Advocacy. In *Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada: Defending a Criminal Case*. Toronto: Richard De Boo Ltd.
- Genova, L.R. (1981).
 Plea Bargaining: In the End, Who Really Benefits? *Canadian Criminology Forum*, 4: 30-44.
- Goulet, L.S. (1982).
 Prosecutorial Discretion. in S. Oxner, ed., *Criminal Justice: Papers Presented at the Conference of Criminal Justice, Halifax*. Toronto: Carswell.
- Grosman, B. (1969).*
The Prosecutor. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Grosman, B. (1969).
 Conflict and Compromise in the Criminal Courts: New Directions in Legal Research. *Criminal Law Quarterly*, 11: 292-302.
- Hagan, J. (1975).*
 Parameters of Criminal Prosecution: An Application of Path Analysis to a Problem of Criminal Justice. *Journal of Criminal Law, Criminology and Police Science*, 65: 536-544.
- Hartnagel, T.H. and Wynne, D.F. (1975).*
 Plea Negotiations in Canada. *Canadian Journal of Criminology and Corrections*, 17: 45-56.
- Helder, H. (1979).*
 The Police, Case Negotiation and the Para-Legal System. Unpublished Thesis, Centre of Criminology, University of Toronto.
- Hyman, R. (1970).
 Legal Bargaining. *Chitty's Law Journal*, 18: 266.
- Klein, A.D. (1972).
 Plea Bargaining. *Criminal Law Quarterly*, 14: 289-305.
- Klein, J.F. (1973).
 Habitual Offender Legislation and the Bargaining Process. *Criminal Law Quarterly*, 15: 417-436.

- Klein, J.F. (1978).
Revitalizing Restitution: Flogging a Dead Horse That May Have Been Killed for a Just Cause. *Criminal Law Quarterly*, 20: 383-408.
- Klein, J.F. (1978).
Inducements to Plead Guilty: Frontier Justice Revisited. in P. Wickman and P. Whitten, eds., *Readings in Criminology*. Lexington, Mass.: Lexington Books.
- Klein, J.F. (1979).*
Let's Make a Deal: Negotiating Justice. Lexington, Mass.: Lexington Books.
- Law Reform Commission of Canada (1974-75).
Fourth Annual Report. Ottawa: Information Canada.
- Law Reform Commission of Canada (1984).
Disclosure by the Prosecution, Report #22. Ottawa: Ministry of Supply and Services.
- Lynch, M.E. (1979).*
Disclosure and Argument in "Plea Bargaining" Sessions. in J.L. Wilkins, ed., *The Prosecution and the Courts*. Toronto: Centre of Criminology, University of Toronto.
- MacKay, A.W. (1982).
The Influence of the Prosecutor: Plea Bargaining, Stay of Proceedings, Controlling the Process. in S. Oxner, ed., *Criminal Justice: Papers Presented at the Conference of Criminal Justice, Halifax*. Toronto: Carswell.
- Martin, G.A. (1970).
The Role and the Responsibility of the Defence Advocate. *Criminal Law Quarterly*, 12: 376-393.
- Mewett, A.W. (1970).
Editorial: Plea Bargaining. *Criminal Law Quarterly*, 12: 245-246.
- Ontario Law Reform Commission (1973).
Report on the Administration of Ontario Courts (Part II). Toronto.
- Osborne, J.A. (1983).*
The Prosecutor's Discretion to Withdraw Criminal Cases in the Lower Courts. *Canadian Journal of Criminology*, 25: 55-78.
- Parker, G. (1972).
Copping a Plea. *Chitty's Law Journal*, 20: 310.
- Perras, D.W. (1979).
Plea Negotiations. *Criminal Law Quarterly*, 22: 58-?
- Perras, D.W. (1979).
Plea Negotiations. *Saskatchewan Law Review*, 44: 143-153.
- Ratushny, E.I. (1972).
Plea Bargaining and the Public. *Chitty's Law Journal*, 20: 228-241.

- Rizkalla, M. (1980).*
Pre-Trial Discovery: Evaluation of the Montreal Project. Unpublished Research Report.
- Soloman, P.H. (1983).*
Criminal Justice Policy, From Research to Reform. Toronto: Butterworths.
- Taylor, K.W. (1982).*
 Multiple Association Analysis of Race and Plea Negotiations: The Wynne and Hartnagel Data. *Canadian Journal of Sociology*, 7: 391-401.
- Thomas, P. (1972).
 The Judicial Approach to Plea Bargaining. *Manitoba Law Journal*, 5: 201-204.
- Verdun-Jones, S.N. and Cousineau, D.F. (1979).
 Cleansing the Augean Stables: A Critical Analysis of Recent Trends in the Plea Bargaining Debate in Canada. *Osgoode Hall Law Journal*, 17: 227-260.
- Warner, A.H. and Renner, K.E. (1981).*
 The Bureaucratic and Adversary Models of the Criminal Courts: The Criminal Sentencing Process. *Windsor Yearbook of Access to Justice*, 1: 81-93.
- Wilkins, J.A. (1979).*
The Prosecution and the Courts. Toronto: Centre of Criminology, University of Toronto.
- Wynne, D.F. and Hartnagel, T.F. (1975).*
 Race and Plea Negotiation: An Analysis of Some Canadian Data. *Canadian Journal of Sociology*, 1: 147-155.